BORA LASKIN LAW LIBRARY
3 1761 04860 3435

RESTITUTION

2001 — 2002

Professor E.J. Weinrib

Faculty of Law

University of Toronto

BORA LASKIN LAW LIBRARY
SEP - 5 2001
FACULTY OF LAW
UNIVERSITY OF TORONTO

RESTITUTION

2001 — 2002

Professor E.J. Weinrib

Faculty of Law

University of Toronto

Digitized by the Internet Archive
in 2018 with funding from
University of Toronto

https://archive.org/details/restitution00wein_8

Restitution

I. THE NATURE OF RESTITUTION

Aristotle, Nicomachean Ethics, Book Five 1129a26 - 1132b20,
(Ostwald trans.) 1
Corrective Justice in a Nutshell, Ernest J. Weinrib 6
Edwards v. Lee's Administrator, 96 S.W. (2d) 1028 (Ky. C.A., 1936) 13
Vincent v. Lake Erie Transportation Co. (1910), 124 N.W. 222 (Minn. S.C.) 17
Extract from American Restatement of Restitution (1937),
§ 122. Benefits Derived From the Exercise of Incomplete Privilege 20
Palmer, The Law of Restitution, Volume I, 139-140
(Boston and Toronto: Little, Brown, 1978) 22

II. THE DEVELOPMENT OF RESTITUTION

Moses v. MacFerlan (1760), 97 E.R. 676, 2 Burr. 1005 (K.B.) 1
Dobbs, Handbook on the Law of Remedies, (St. Paul: West, 1973) 229 4
Extract from American Restatement of Restitution (1937) 19
Seavey and Scott, Restitution, (1938) 54 Law Quarterly Review 29,
29-32, 36-39 21
Deglman v. Guaranty Trust Co. and Constantineau, [1954] S.C.R. 725;
[1954] 3 D.L.R. 785 25
Pavey & Matthews Proprietary Ltd. v. Paul (1986) 162 C.L.R. 221
(H.C. Australia) 27
Pettkus v. Becker (1980), 117 D.L.R. (3d) 257 (S.C.C.) 32
Peter v. Beblow (1993), 101 D.L.R. (4th) 621 (S.C.C.) 40
Dublin v. Building and Allied Trade Union [1996] 2 ILRM 547 (S.C.) 50

III. UNREQUESTED BENEFITS

1. Basic Ideas

Taylor v. Laird (1856), 156 E.R. 1203 1
Moule v. Garrett (1872), L.R. 7 Ex. 101 (Ex. Chamber) 2
Brooks Wharf & Bull Wharf, Ltd. v. Goodman Bros., [1936] 3 All E.R. 696 (C.A.) 4
Ruabon Steamship Co. v. London Assurance, [1990] A.C. 6 (H.L.) 7
Jenkins v. Tucker (1788) 126 ER 555 (C.P.) 11
Shallcross v. Wright (1850) 50 E.R. 1174 13
Restatement of Restitution - s. 2 15
Birks, An Introduction to the Law of Restitution (1985) 101-103 16

2. Preserving Another's Property

Nicholson v. Chapman (1793) 126 E.R. 536 (C.P.) 18
Falcke v. Scottish Imperial Insurance Company (1886), 34 Ch. D. 234 20
Great Northern Railway v. Swaffield (1874) L.R. 9 Ex. 132 (Exch.) 26
Prager v. Blatspiel, Stamp and Heacock, [1924] 1 KB 566 (KBD) 29
Jebara v. Ottoman Bank, [1927] 2 KB 254 (C.A.) 31
China Pacific S.A. v. Food Corporation of India (The Winston), [1982] A.C. 939 (H.L.) 32
Restatement of Restitution - s. 117 39

3. Preserving Another's Health

Hastings v. Semans Village, [1946] 4 D.L.R. 695 (Sask. C.A.) 41
Matheson v. Smiley, [1932] 2 D.L.R. 787 (Man. C.A.) 45
Restatement of Restitution - s. 116 47

4. Discharging Another's Liability

Traders Realty Ltd. v. Huron Heights Shopping Plaza Ltd. (1967), 64 D.L.R. (2d) 278 (Ont. S.C.) 49
Owen v. Tate, [1975] 2 All E.R. 129 (C.A.) 52
County of Carleton v. City of Ottawa, [1965] S.C.R. 663 59
Norton v. Haggett (1952), 85 A. 2d 571 (Vt. S.C.) 61

5. Incontrovertible Benefits

Regional Municipality of Peel v. Her Majesty the Queen in right of Canada (1992), 98 D.L.R. (4th) 140 (S.C.C.) 63

IV. MISTAKEN PAYMENTS

1. The Irrelevance of Fault

Kelly v. Solari (1841), 9 M & W 54, 152 E.R. 24 1
Clark v. Eckroyd (1885), 12 O.A.R. 425 3
R.E. Jones v. Waring and Gillow, [1926] A.C. 670 (H.L.) 6

2. The Nature of the Mistake

Aiken v. Short (1856), 1 H. & N. 210, 156 E.R. 1180 10
Birks, An Introduction to the Law of Restitution (1985) 148-154 11

Barclays Bank Ltd. v. W. J. Simms Son & Cooke (Southern) Ltd., [1979] 3 All E.R. 522 (Q.B.) 14
David Securities v. Commonwealth Bank of Australia (1992) 175 C.L.R. 353 (H.C. Australia) 23
Lowe v. Wells Fargo & Co. Express (1908), 96 p. 74.(S.C. of Kansas) 24
Larner v. London County Council, [1949] 1 All E.R. 964 (C.A.) 26
Lady Hood of Avalon v. MacKinnon, [1909] 1 Ch. 476 28

3. Change of Position

Rural Municipality of Storthoaks v. Mobil Oil Canada Ltd. (1975), 55 D.L.R. (3d) 1 (S.C.C.) 31
Lipkin Gorman v. Karpnale, [1992] 4 All E.R. 512 (H.L.) 33
RBC Dominion Securities Inc. v. Dawson (1994), 111 D.L.R. (4th) 230 (Nfld. C.A.) 45
South Tyneside Metropolitan Borough Council v. Svenska International plc [1995] 1 All E.R. 545 (Q.B.D., Comm. Ct.) 54
Cheese v. Thomas [1994] 1 All E.R. 35 (C.A., Civ. Div.) 61

4. Mistake of Law and Invalid Exactions

Hydro Electric Commission of Nepean Twp. v. Ontario Hydro (1982), 132 D.L.R. (3d) 193 (S.C.C.) 67
Air Canada v. British Columbia (1989), 59 D.L.R. (4th) 161 (S.C.C.) 78
Commissioner of State Revenue (Victoria) v. Royal Insurance Australia Ltd. (1994) 182 C.L.R. 51 (H.C. Australia) 88
Kleinwort Benson v. Birmingham City Council [1994] 4 All E.R. 733 (C.A., Civ. Div.) 93

V. MISTAKEN BENEFITS

Nicholson v. St. Denis (1975), 8 O.R. (2d) 315 (C.A.) 1
Greenwood v. Bennett, [1973] 1 Q.B. 195 (C.A.) 5
Gidney v. Shank [1995] 5 W.W.R. 385 (Man Q.B.) 9
Gidney v. Shank reversed [1996] 2 W.W.R. 383 (Man C.A.) 15
Montreuil v. The Ontario Asphalt Company (1921), 63 S.C.R. 401 17
LAC Minerals Ltd. v. International Corona Resources Ltd. (1987), 44 D.L.R. (4th) 592 (Ont. C.A.); (1989) 61 D.L.R. (4th) 14 (S.C.C.) 25

VI. BENEFITS CONFERRED UNDER COMPULSION

Astley v. Reynolds (1731), 93 E.R. 939 K.B. 1
Skeate v. Beale (1841), 113 E.R. 688 2
Knutson v. The Bourkes Syndicate, [1941] S.C.R. 419 3
Peter Kiewit Sons' Co. of Canada v. Eakins Construction Ltd., [1960] S.C.R. 361 5
Morton Construction Co. Ltd. v. City of Hamilton, [1962] O.R. 154 (C.A.) 10
Smith v. William Charlick Ltd. (1924) 34 C.L.R. 38 (H.C.) 12
Pao On v. Lau Yiu, [1979] 3 All E.R. 65 (P.C.) 15
Universe Tankships Inc. of Monrovia v. International Transport Workers Federation, [1983] A.C. 366 (H.L.) 21
Thorne v. Motor Trade Association, [1937] A.C. 797 (H.L.) 26
CTN Cash and Carry Ltd. v. Gallaher, [1994] 4 All E.R. 714 29
Eadie v. Township of Brantford, [1967] S.C.R. 523 33

VII. RESTITUTION FOR WRONGS

1. Tortious Wrongs

Lamine v. Dorrell (1701), Ld. Ray. 1216 1
United Australia v. Barclays Bank, [1941] A.C. 1 (H.L.) 2
Phillips v. Homfray (1883), 24 Ch. D. 439 7
Strand Electric and Engineering v. Brisford Entertainments, [1952] 2 Q.B. 246 (C.A.) 11
Olwell v. Nye and Nissen, 173 P. 2d 652 (Wash. S.C., 1946) 16

2. Breaches of Fiduciary Obligation

Reading v. Attorney General, [1951] A.C. 507 (H.L.) 19
Attorney-General for Hong Kong v. Reid, [1994] 1 A.C. 324 (P.C.) 24

3. Breaches of Contract

British Motor Trade Association v. Gilbert, [1951] 2 All E.R. 641 (Ch.D.) 33
New Orleans v. Firemen's Charitable Association, 9 SO. 486 (La S.C., 1891) 35
County Council of Surrey v. Bredero Homes, [1993] 3 All E.R. 705 (C.A., Civ. Div.) 36
Adras Building Materials v. Harlow & Jones, February 11, 1988 (Supreme Court of Israel); [1995] Restitution Law Review 235 45
Attorney General v. Blake [2000] 4 All E.R. 385 (H.L.) 56